Research Africa Reviews Vol. 7 No. 2, August 2023
These reviews may be found on the *RA Reviews* website at:
https://sites.duke.edu/researchafrica/ra-reviews/volume-7-2023/volume-7-issue-2-aug-2023/

Brahim El Guabli, *Moroccan Other-Archives: History and Citizenship After State Violence*. New York: Fordham University Press, 2023. 288pp. ISBN: 9781531501464.

Reviewed by: Nathaniel Mathews, SUNY-Binghamton.

This fascinating and ambitious book by Brahim El Guabli explores a Moroccan landscape of subversive and forgotten memories at the intersection of history and literature. Examining testimonials from Moroccan prisons, advocacy work by Imazighen language activists, and migrations of the Moroccan Jewish diaspora, El Guabli shows how memory work on these topics triggered different social processes of collective remembering among Moroccans from decolonization up to the present. El Guabli defines 'other-archives' as 'loci' of memories where "the stories of those left out of history and traditional archives reside" (x). El Guabli asserts the power of the archive to shape a narrative which 'other-archives' challenge and argues that these sources and testimonies from unconventional locations have helped to reconfigure the meaning of Morocco's recent past; even, El Guabli contends, Moroccan historians have not yet fully recognized living memory's potential for writing history (155). Given the absence of a national archive in Morocco until 2011, the issue of a truly inclusive national history is at the center of El Guabli's ethical concern with memory.

After an opening chapter about efforts to preserve the Amazigh language in Morocco, the book spends its remaining chapters exploring two significant series of events in modern Morocco. The first is the emigration to Israel of 220,000 (of an estimated 250,000) Moroccan Jews between 1948 and 1964. El Guabli deftly situates these migrations within the debates about the character of Moroccan national citizenship, showing how mixed-faith marriages and interreligious solidarity within the left complicated national belonging for Moroccan Jews. Some strongly identified with the new emerging Moroccan national territorial identity as a progressive aspiration, while others were tempted by the prospect of citizenship elsewhere. He briefly discusses the operation whereby U.S. food aid was given to Morocco, contingent on a departure agreement for Moroccan Jews going to Israel. The dilemmas of Moroccan Jews are evocatively portrayed in Ibrahim Hariri's 2013 novel *Shāmma aw Shtrīt*, and El Guabli's discussion of this work and several other fictional narratives brings out the relevance of literature for commenting on the politics of citizenship in Morocco.

The second set of events were a period of political repression in Morocco from 1956-1999, commonly termed the 'years of lead.' This period which included two coup attempts against the Moroccan king, resulted in the imprisonment, torture, and disappearance of thousands of suspected dissidents into the notorious Tazmamart prison. These disappearances devastated civil society in Morocco and left victims' families without information or truth of the whereabouts of their loved ones. Theorizing Moroccan prisoner testimonies, El Guabli describes their disruptive potential as a 'scandalous other-archive.' Once made public, the testimony of prisoners is associated with particular individuals and is taken up into an 'embodied other-archive.' From El Guabli, we learn that "embodied" other-archives are "witness accounts of survivors' lived experiences of hitherto-silenced state violence." This embodied 'other-archive' is then gradually taken up by writers and transformed into a 'fictionalized' other-archive, a corpus of novels in which particular historical experiences are thinly disguised as fiction.

The book works well as an explanation of what happens to a locus of memory as it moves from private to public, its impact on national consciousness among different groups, and its simultaneous appropriation and disavowal by state authorities. Psychologists and scholars of social memory have demonstrated that memory is malleable in terms of its coherence within the mind, its recall within oral or written narrative, and its transmission to the next generation. El Guabli shows that original memories of torture and imprisonment in Tazmamart have evolved through the social and political crises they provoked in the national media into a collective cultural property in the next generation. The testimony of living historical subjects was originally used to raise awareness of human rights abuses in Morocco and is now being gradually transformed as it becomes broadly known by the Moroccan public, while at the same time continuing to become more distant from the original events. The distinctions made by El Guabli between three types of 'other-archive' are historical transformations within a collection of memories as they become properties of a larger group over time. The book is very strong in making the case for the relevance of a broader cultural history approach to Morocco's recent past. It also deftly presents the actions and reactions of professional historians to the emergence of testimonies and engages the history of various organizations collecting, curating, and promoting an Amazigh-speaking public culture. It is impossible to miss from the juxtaposition of El Guabli's case studies that the process of fictionalizing memory may in some cases precede interest in this recent past by the historical profession within Morocco. El Guabli argues this is the result of Moroccan historians' tendency to see this recent past as more subversive than the 'dead' history of the colonial protectorate or of Islamic empires in the national territory.

El Guabli's insistence on referring to loci of memory as archives is at least partially motivated by a 2016 conversation with the director of the Archives du Maroc, who, when asked by El Guabli if cultural material about the years of lead constituted an archive, replied that they were not, and recommended El Guabli try the National Council for Human Rights. Given this context, the term 'other-archive' in the book is a metaphor for cultural productions from the occluded periphery and a plea for them to more directly inform a new and critical national historical production. In other words, El Guabli wants to confront the historical establishment in Morocco with these memories, demonstrating their potential to revise traditional narratives of modern Moroccan history. The 'other-archive' is a way for El Guabli to talk about the cultural production of Moroccan Jews, Imazighen, and political prisoners in relation to the complacency and conservatism of Moroccan nationalist historiography. The book's main theoretical issue is the definitional problems associated with making 'archive' a metaphor for cultural production, which results in broadening the definition of the term to mean any trace of the past in objects. At various points in the book, the Tifinagh script adopted as an official language of Morocco in 2003, and a corpus of fiction based on testimony are called 'other-archives.' Broadly speaking, an other-archive in El Guabli's conception may be any person, place or object that human memory attaches itself to that the nation-state forgot. The meaning of this new term is reliant on assumptions about the meaning of the archive as a centralizing, hegemonizing force, coming from an idea that archives contain the power to reshape present reality. But the extension of the concept to mean any site of memory obscures the word's conventional meaning (which El Guabli also gestures to in the text), to the dual detriment of a clearer understanding of the protean dimensions of social memories, and the composite character of the archive. It would have been sufficient to distinguish transformations within 'memory': between subjective bodily experience, giving voice to that experience or writing it down (testimony or narration), and the abstracting, revising, and inventing of experience and voices into new narratives (fiction), without resorting to a neologism. Not every repeated impulse to remember and preserve is 'archival;' an archive isn't equivalent to a historical trace. Finally, many of the argued to be unique qualities of an 'other-archive' are also true of documents within the national archive. A national archive contains multiple loci of memories and thus preserves many stories and names incomplete and thus left out of written narrative history. There is no necessary correspondence between a document's inclusion into an archive and its inclusion into a narrative; many documents are included in the archive and then immediately forgotten, while excluded documents are not necessarily 'othered' beyond the reach of historical narrative due to their exclusion. I applaud El Guabli's decision to confront historians with the relevance of cultural history 'from below.' Ignoring memory's influence on history is inexcusable, but

historians should (and many do) treat memories with the same skepticism with which they have approached archival documents. Such skepticism has more to do with the goals of the historical vocation and need not be the result of the fetishization of documents or the kicking against progress of the old guard.

Overall, this book is a serious engagement with the politics of memory and national citizenship. It urges Moroccan historians to explore Morocco's turbulent modern history more fully by taking recent cultural productions seriously as historical sources. It will no doubt be edifying to see if and how Moroccan historians respond to the challenges of El Guabli's unique book.

Research Africa

ISSN 2575-6990