EXPERT REVIEWS

The potential to predict the course of childhood asthma

5

Daniel W Belsky[1] and Malcolm R Sears*[2]

[1]Centre for the Study of Aging and Human Development, Institute for Genome Sciences and Policy, Duke University Medical Centre, Durham, NC 27708, USA
[2]AstraZeneca Chair in Respiratory Epidemiology, McMaster University, Firestone Institute for Respiratory Health, St Joseph's Healthcare, Hamilton, Ontario L8N 4A6, Canada
*Author for correspondence:
Tel.: +1 905 522 1155 ext. 33286
Fax: +1 905 521 6132
searsm@mcmaster.ca

AQ2

Many children experience pre-school or early childhood wheezing. In a significant proportion symptoms disappear as the child grows, but others have persistent and troublesome asthma which can be life-long. Tools to predict course of disease in young children are a priority for families and clinicians. This review summarizes evidence from several longitudinal population-based birth-cohort studies that have identified risk factors for persistence and remission of childhood asthma. These factors include clinical characteristics, environmental and other exposures, familial factors, biomarkers of allergic inflammation, measurements of lung function and airway responsiveness, and genetic variants. This review also introduces the concept of polygenic risk and genetic risk scores, and describes results from a recent study that suggests promise for the use of genetic information in predicting the course of childhood asthma. We conclude with a discussion of implications and future directions.

10

15

Asthma is the commonest chronic noncommunicable disease of childhood. Prevalence figures vary, but up to 20% of children report recurrent wheezing. In some, early childhood wheezing disappears, but others have persistent and troublesome life-long asthma [1–4]. Identification of children whose symptoms will persist and who will develop more troublesome disease is a clinical priority. Which children should be more actively treated for asthma in the hope of reducing long-term morbidity? Can we use clinical characteristics, physiological measurements, biomarkers or genetics to more precisely determine outcomes? When can we reassure parents that their child will 'outgrow' asthma? Sensitive and specific tests to determine which children will suffer persistent symptoms and which will recover remain a work in progress, but longitudinal population-based birth cohort studies provide insights into risk factors for persistent disease [3,5–11].

Sex & age at onset

Persistence is more frequent in boys in most longitudinal studies tracking asthma from early to middle childhood [8,10], although not all studies find sex differences [9]. In studies with a longer duration of follow-up, asthma persistence after puberty is more frequent in girls [3,5]. Earlier age of onset is associated with increased risk of asthma persistence. In the

Tucson Children's Respiratory Study, asthma onset by 6 years of age and persistent wheezing in early life predicted sevenfold and 14-fold increases in odds of chronic asthma at 22 years of age [5]. In the Dunedin longitudinal study, each 1-year increase in age at asthma onset predicted 11% decrease in the odds of persistent asthma [3].

Symptom severity

More frequent/severe childhood symptoms predict increased risk of asthma persistence. In a report from Tasmania, only 25% of children continued to wheeze as adults [1], whereas in a simultaneous report from Melbourne, the rate of persistence was 70% [12]. This discrepancy was due to the Melbourne cohort being 'enriched' with children with more severe asthma [13]. Many studies confirm that more severe symptoms predict a doubling or tripling of the odds of persistence [6,8,14,15].

Rhinoconjunctivitis & eczema

Rhinoconjunctivitis and eczema increase the likelihood of persistence [14]. In the Tasmanian study, 29.7% of persistent atopic asthma was attributable to concomitant childhood eczema or rhinitis; the combination of these two risk factors predicted a nearly 12-fold increase in the odds of adult atopic asthma [16,17]. In the Prevention and Incidence of Asthma and Mite

25

30

35

40

45

50

Allergy (PIAMA) study, eczema before the age of 4 years more than doubled the odds that early symptoms would persist to become overt clinical asthma at age 7–8 years [8].

Allergy

Allergic sensitization, a major driver of development of asthma, is also related to persistence of disease [18]. In the German Multicentre Allergy Study (MAS), sensitization to indoor (mite, cat and dog) allergens by the age of 3 years gave a positive predicted value of 57% for asthma at 11–13 years; when exposure to cat, dog or mite allergen before the age of 3 years was in the upper quartile of the distribution in the total MAS population, positive predicted value for persistent asthma was 83% [7]. Early childhood allergic sensitization also predicted diminished lung function and airway hyperresponsiveness (AHR) at ages 7–13 years in the MAS cohort [19]. Allergens of interest differ according to location; in the Tucson cohort, sensitization to *Alternaria alternata* by the age of 6 years trebled the odds of chronic asthma at 22 years [5].

Infection

In the Isle of Wight study, persistence to age 10 years was doubled in those with a history of recurrent chest infections at 2 years [20]. In the PIAMA cohort, respiratory tract infections one- to two-times per year between birth and 4 years almost doubled the risk of asthma at age 7–8 years, while ≥3 infections per year almost trebled the risk [8]. Among 198 sensitized children in Perth, the risk of subsequent persistent wheeze was 49% with three severe lower respiratory tract illnesses in the first 2 years of life, increasing to 75% with six such episodes [21]. Early childhood infections may also predispose to other risk factors for asthma persistence, such as atopy, although whether viral infection is causal of asthma or instead acts to reveal latent disease is uncertain [22].

Socioeconomic status

In the PIAMA and Generation R cohorts, respectively, medium or low parental education was associated with a 50 and 60% increase in the odds of persistent childhood asthma relative to children with highly educated parents [8,10]. These associations likely reflect a combination of physical and social environmental factors [23].

Allergic inflammation

Blood eosinophils have been measured for decades as markers of allergic inflammation and have a modest predictive role with respect to persistent asthma. Eosinophilia >470/mm^3 was a risk factor (p < 0.001) for persistence of wheezing at age 6 in a clinical cohort of infants in France [24]. Blood eosinophilia ≥4% is included in the minor criteria of the Asthma Predictive Index [25]. Measurements of serum IgE from birth onward have often been assessed for their predictive role in the development of asthma but may also predict persistence. In the PIAMA cohort, specific IgE measured at 4 years predicted an almost threefold increase in the odds of wheezing and asthma at 8 years

after adjustments for clinical status [26]. In the MAS cohort, elevated total IgE at 3 years in children with wheeze before the age of 3 years trebled the risk of wheezing at 11–13 years [7].

Lung function

In the Tucson cohort, low airway function at 6 years, defined as flow rates in the lowest quartile of VmaxFRC, doubled the **AQ3** risk of chronic asthma at 22 years [5]. Abnormal interrupter resistance measured at age 4 years in PIAMA was associated with wheezing at age 6 years, independently of the clinical history, but not at 7 and 8 years [26]. In the Dunedin cohort, study members with persistent adult asthma were found to have had low lung function from the first measurement at age 9 years, suggesting airflow obstruction developed at a young age in those destined to have persistent disease [3].

AHR measurements likewise have predictive value. In the Tucson cohort, AHR measured by cold air challenge at 6 years predicted a more than fourfold increase in the odds of chronic asthma at 22 years [5]. In the Dunedin cohort, children with positive methacholine challenges in childhood were at a threefold increased risk of persisting asthma in young adulthood [3]. In the Norwegian birth cohort, AHR at age 10 years appeared to be a weak predictor of persistence at age 16 years [27]. However, the predictive value improved substantially when results were stratified by severity; 54% of those with the greatest degree of AHR (PD$_{20}$ ≤1 μmol) at 10 years had active asthma at 16 years [28].

Exhaled fraction of Nitric Oxide had predictive value both in relation to onset of new asthma [29] and persistence. In the PIAMA cohort, each IQR increase in log10 exhaled fraction of **AQ4** Nitric Oxide measured at 4 years predicted a 60% increase in odds of wheezing and asthma at 8 years, even after adjusting for IgE and clinical history [26].

Genetics

A positive family history of asthma or atopy is associated with increased risk of asthma persistence. In the PIAMA, Generation R and MAS cohorts, 'any parental asthma' more than doubled the odds of asthma persistence [7,8,10]. Evidence is mixed as to whether the sex of the parent with asthma matters to risk of transmission [9,24].

Genetic variants discovered in genome-wide association studies (GWASs) may also provide prognostic information about **AQ5** the course of asthma. GWASs have identified genes that modulate aspects of the natural history of asthma such as atopy, lung development and susceptibility to more severe disease, suggesting promise for genetic prediction of the course of asthma [30]. GWASs of the course of asthma are not yet feasible because relatively few data exist that follow children into adulthood [31]. GWASs have discovered loci associated with childhood onset of asthma [32–35] and revealed asthma to be highly polygenic – influenced by many different genetic factors, each which make small contributions to pathogenesis [36]. A promising approach to studying polygenic conditions is to use 'genetic risk scores' that summarize information from a set of discovered risk

variants to produce a continuously distributed index of genetic liability [37–42]. Because genetic risk scores aggregate information from multiple risk variants, they measure a larger genetic effect and can be studied in much smaller samples than are required for GWAS. Genetic risk scores thus provide an opportunity to test how genetic risks discovered in GWAS relate to persistence of asthma [43].

A genetic risk score study of the natural history of asthma at age 38 years has been conducted in the Dunedin cohort [11]. The score used in that study comprised 15 variants discovered in the GABRIEL Consortium asthma GWASs of over 26,000 cases and controls [35]. In the Dunedin cohort, a higher genetic risk score not only predicted asthma with onset early in childhood, atopy and AHR, but also predicted life-course persistence of asthma and development of incompletely reversible airflow obstruction, more days missed from school and work due to asthma and increased likelihood of admission to hospital. Within the 21% of the cohort who had developed asthma by the age of 13 years, those with higher genetic risk were more likely to suffer symptoms through age 38 years; each standard deviation (SD) increase in the genetic risk score predicted a 20% increase in the risk of persistent asthma through midlife.

The small magnitude of the genetic effect means that even for children with asthma who have very low or very high genetic risk scores, course is uncertain; one in three children with a genetic risk score 2 SDs below the mean may be expected to suffer persistent symptoms, while one in three with a genetic risk score 2 SDs above the mean may be expected to experience remission. Genetic effects were similarly modest for other outcomes. Further, among cohort members who never developed asthma, genetic risk was normally distributed – meaning that a proportion of individuals with very high genetic risk scores never developed asthma. Therefore, these results require a cautious approach regarding the clinical implementation of genetic testing in asthma care [44]. Additionally, replication is needed of the observations from the Dunedin cohort.

It is uncertain whether even large increases in GWAS sample size will substantially improve genetic prediction for asthma [45,46]. The next step in translating GWAS discoveries into tools useful to the clinician is therefore to integrate information about genetics with information about the environment [44,47]. New evidence that the 17q21 locus repeatedly replicated in asthma GWAS is made more virulent by childhood exposure to rhinovirus [48] highlights the potential in such gene–environment interaction research. Other promising environments to examine in relation to GWAS discoveries include early-life allergen and microbial exposures, both in cases where evidence for association with asthma is conflicting, such as breastfeeding [49,50] and dog and cat ownership [51], and cases where risk and protective effects are well established, such as microbial exposures associated with growing up in a farm environment [52–54]. As additional gene–environment interactions in asthma are documented, it may be possible to develop algorithms that generate sufficiently sensitive and specific predictions to be useful in the clinic.

Can we currently predict the course of asthma? In 2008, an ERS Task Force proposed a new classification to divide the heterogeneous population with early childhood wheezing into 'episodic (viral) wheeze' and 'multi-trigger wheeze' on the basis of published scientific findings and expert opinion [55]. In a recent analysis of PIAMA study data, Savenije and colleagues [56] found that the ERS taskforce classification showed little correspondence with wheezing phenotypes derived from longitudinal latent class analysis [57] or hypothesis-based definitions of transient early or persistent wheeze as originally described in the Tucson study [58]. Other published prediction rules to identify preschool children having asthma at school age [25,59] were considered of limited value. The path to improved prediction will require refinement of existing approaches – increasing precision of risk factor definitions, more precise phenotyping with objective measures, combining noninvasive measures with prediction rules – incorporation of novel biomarkers – DNA sequence variants, gene expression and epigenetic marking profiles – and identification and incorporation of interactions among environmental, genetic and phenotypic risk factors [56].

In conclusion, there is broad agreement among population studies that childhood wheezing that is frequent and severe, and is associated with atopy, impaired lung function and airway hyperresponsiveness, is likely to be persistent throughout childhood and into adulthood. The possibilities of genomic prediction, including genetic risk scores, gene–environment interactions and transcriptomic and epigenetic signatures, are just beginning to be explored. Much more remains to be done before we can, with a high level of confidence, predict on an individual level which children will have persistent asthma.

Expert commentary

Prospective longitudinal studies of population-based birth cohorts have identified a number of risk factors for persistence of childhood asthma. Collectively, these studies indicate that young age at onset, presence of severe symptoms in early childhood, allergic sensitization, respiratory infection and family history of asthma predispose to a persistent course of disease. Algorithms that integrate risk factor information cannot yet generate accurate predictions of course of disease, nor do the various algorithms that exist agree consistently in their predictions regarding specific cases. Increased precision of risk factor definitions and standardization of phenotyping of asthma may improve algorithm performance. In addition, genetic and genomic studies of asthma are beginning to uncover novel biomarkers of risk for persistent disease. Next steps in improving capacity to predict the course of asthma include integrating these discoveries with established environmental and phenotypic risk factors.

Five-year view

Rapidly declining cost of genomic assays has enabled a growing number of birth cohort studies to add genomic measurements to their databases. As GWASs and other hypothesis-free methods continue to identify novel genomic markers of disease risk, these measurements will be incorporated into studies that profile

characteristics of persistent compared with remitting childhood asthma. The addition of genetic information to existing algorithms is likely to improve prediction of the course of childhood asthma incrementally. To achieve substantive advance in the capacity to predict course of childhood asthma, scientific breakthroughs are needed, which elucidate interactions among the genome, disease phenotypes and environmental risk factors.

Key issues

- Childhood asthma is common. For many children, asthma is a childhood-limited problem, but for others, symptoms persist across the life course.
- Risk factors for persistent asthma have been identified from birth cohort studies that follow unselected samples of children over time and track the onset and course of asthma.
- Risk factors for persistent asthma include young age at onset, manifestation of severe symptoms including airway hyperresponsiveness and airflow obstruction in early childhood, rhinoconjunctivitis and eczema, childhood allergic sensitization, respiratory infections and family history of asthma.
- Genome-wide association studies have discovered asthma-associated genetic variants and revealed that most of the population carries some degree of genetic risk for asthma, while smaller groups are at especially low or especially high risk.
- Children with asthma who carry higher levels of genetic risk may be predisposed to a persistent course of disease, according to one birth cohort study, although genetic predictions have low sensitivity and specificity.
- Despite efforts to combine information across risk factors, it is not yet possible to predict course of childhood onset asthma with accuracy, and existing predictive algorithms often yield conflicting results.
- More precise definitions of risk factors and standardized approaches to phenotyping asthma are needed to improve accuracy of predictive algorithms.
- Integrating genomic information into prediction algorithms may also improve accuracy, especially if interactions among genomic, phenotypic and environmental factors can be quantified.

References

1. Jenkins MA, Hopper JL, Bowes G, et al. Factors in childhood as predictors of asthma in adult life. BMJ 1994;309(6947):90-3
2. Strachan D, Butland B, Anderson H. Incidence and prognosis of asthma and wheezing illness from early childhood to age 33 in a national British cohort. BMJ 1996;312(7040):1195-9
3. Sears MR, Greene JM, Willan AR, et al. A longitudinal, population-based, cohort study of childhood asthma followed to adulthood. N Engl J Med 2003;349(15):1414-22
4. Horak E, Lanigan A, Roberts M, et al. Longitudinal study of childhood wheezy bronchitis and asthma: outcome at age 42. BMJ 2003;326:422-3
5. Stern DA, Morgan WJ, Halonen M, et al. Wheezing and bronchial hyper-responsiveness in early childhood as predictors of newly diagnosed asthma in early adulthood: a longitudinal birth-cohort study. Lancet 2008;372(9643):1058-64
6. Devulapalli CS, Carlsen KCL, Håland G, et al. Severity of obstructive airways disease by age 2 years predicts asthma at 10 years of age. Thorax 2008;63(1):8-13
7. Matricardi PM, Illi S, Grüber C, et al. Wheezing in childhood: incidence, longitudinal patterns and factors predicting persistence. Eur Respir J 2008;32(3):585-92
8. Caudri D, Wijga A, A Schipper CM, et al. Predicting the long-term prognosis of children with symptoms suggestive of asthma at preschool age. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2009;124(5):903-10.e7
9. Burgess JA, Matheson MC, Gurrin LC, et al. Factors influencing asthma remission: a longitudinal study from childhood to middle age. Thorax 2011;66(6):508-13
10. Hafkamp-de Groen E, Lingsma HF, Caudri D, et al. Predicting asthma in preschool children with asthma-like symptoms: validating and updating the PIAMA risk score. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2013;132(6):1303-10.e6
11. Belsky DW, Sears MR, Hancox RJ, et al. Polygenic risk and the development and course of asthma: an analysis of data from a four-decade longitudinal study. Lancet Respir Med 2013;1(6):453-361
12. Oswald H, Phelan PD, Lanigan A, et al. Outcome of childhood asthma in mid-adult life. BMJ 1994;309(6947):95-6
13. Sears MR. Growing up with asthma. BMJ 1994;309(6947):72-3
14. Panettieri RA Jr, Covar R, Grant E, et al. Natural history of asthma: persistence versus progression-does the beginning predict the end? J Allergy Clin Immunol 2008;121(3):607-13
15. To T, Gershon A, Wang C, et al. Persistence and remission in childhood asthma: a population-based asthma birth cohort study. Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med 2007;161(12):1197-204
16. Burgess JA, Walters EH, Byrnes GB, et al. Childhood allergic rhinitis predicts asthma incidence and persistence to middle age: a longitudinal study. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2007;120(4):863-9
17. Martin PE, Matheson MC, Gurrin L, et al. Childhood eczema and rhinitis predict atopic but not nonatopic adult asthma: a prospective cohort study over 4 decades. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2011;127(6):1473-9.e1

18. Sly PD, Boner AL, Björksten B, et al. Early identification of atopy in the prediction of persistent asthma in children. Lancet 2008; 372(9643):1100-6

19. Illi S, von Mutius E, Lau S, et al. Perennial allergen sensitisation early in life and chronic asthma in children: a birth cohort study. Lancet 2006;368(9537):763-70

20. Kurukulaaratchy RJ, Matthews S, Holgate ST, Arshad SH. Predicting persistent disease among children who wheeze during early life. Eur Respir J 2003;22(5):767-71

21. Holt PG, Rowe J, Kusel M, et al. Toward improved prediction of risk for atopy and asthma among preschoolers: a prospective cohort study. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2010; 125(3):653-9.659.e1–659.e7

22. Fuchs O, von Mutius E. Prenatal and childhood infections: implications for the development and treatment of childhood asthma. Lancet Respir Med 2013;1(9):743-54

23. Schreier HMC, Chen E. Socioeconomic status and the health of youth: a multilevel, multidomain approach to conceptualizing pathways. Psychol Bull 2013;139(3):606-54

24. Just J, Belfar S, Wanin S, et al. Impact of innate and environmental factors on wheezing persistence during childhood. J Asthma 2010;47(4):412-16

25. Castro-Rodríguez JA, Holberg CJ, Wright AL, Martinez FD. A clinical index to define risk of asthma in young children with recurrent wheezing. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2000;162(4 Pt 1):1403-6

26. Caudri D, Wijga AH, Hoekstra MO, et al. Prediction of asthma in symptomatic preschool children using exhaled nitric oxide, Rint and specific IgE. Thorax 2010;65(9):801-7

27. Riiser A, Hovland V, Carlsen K-H, et al. Does bronchial hyperresponsiveness in childhood predict active asthma in adolescence? Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2012;186(16):493-500

28. Sears MR. Predicting new and persistent asthma. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2012; 186(6):469-70

29. Bastain TM, Islam T, Berhane KT, et al. Exhaled nitric oxide, susceptibility and new-onset asthma in the Children's Health Study. Eur Respir J 2011;37(3):523-31

30. Holloway JW, Arshad SH, Holgate ST. Using genetics to predict the natural history of asthma? J Allergy Clin Immunol 2010; 126(2):200-9.quiz 210–211

31. Hancox RJ, Subbarao P, Sears MR. Relevance of birth cohorts to assessment of asthma persistence. Curr Allergy Asthma Rep 2012;12(3):175-84

32. Forno E, Lasky-Su J, Himes B, et al. Genome-wide association study of the age of onset of childhood asthma. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2012;130(1):83-90.e4

33. Bouzigon E, Corda E, Ashcard H, et al. Effect of 17q21 variants and smoking exposure in early-onset asthma. N Engl J Med 2008;359(19):1985-94

34. Halapi E, Gudbjartsson DF, Jonsdottir GM, et al. A sequence variant on 17q21 is associated with age at onset and severity of asthma. Eur J Hum Genet 2010;18(8):902-8

35. Moffatt MF, Gut IG, Demenais F, et al. A large-scale, consortium-based genomewide association study of asthma. N Engl J Med 2010;363(13):1211-21

36. Ferreira MA, Matheson MC, Duffy DL, et al. Identification of IL6R and chromosome 11q13.5 as risk loci for asthma. Lancet 2011;378(9795):1006-14

37. Wray NR, Goddard ME, Visscher PM. Prediction of individual genetic risk to disease from genome-wide association studies. Genome Res 2007;17:1520-8

38. Purcell SM, Wray NR, Stone JL, et al. Common polygenic variation contributes to risk of schizophrenia and bipolar disorder. Nature 2009;460(7256):748-52

39. Evans DM, Visscher PM, Wray NR. Harnessing the information contained within genome-wide association studies to improve individual prediction of complex disease risk. Hum Mol Genet 2009;18(18): 3525-31

40. Plomin R, Haworth CMA, Davis OSP. Common disorders are quantitative traits. Nat Rev Genet 2009;10:872-8

41. Kathiresan S, Melander O, Anevski D, et al. Polymorphisms associated with cholesterol and risk of cardiovascular events. N Engl J Med 2008;358(12):1240-9

42. Ripatti S, Tikkanen E, Orho-Melander M, et al. A multilocus genetic risk score for coronary heart disease: case-control and prospective cohort analyses. Lancet 2010; 376(9750):1393-400

43. Belsky DW, Moffitt TE, Caspi A. Genetics in Population Health Science: strategies and Opportunities. Am J Public Health 2013;103:S73-83

44. Ege MJ, von Mutius E. Can genes forecast asthma risk? Lancet Respir Med 2013;1(6): 425-6

45. Wray NR, Yang J, Hayes BJ, et al. Pitfalls of predicting complex traits from SNPs. Nat Rev Genet 2013;14(7):507-15

46. Roberts NJ, Vogelstein JT, Parmigiani G, et al. The predictive capacity of personal genome sequencing. Sci Transl Med 2012; 4(133):133ra58

47. Guerra S, Martinez FD. Asthma genetics: from linear to multifactorial approaches. Annu Rev Med 2008;59:327-41

48. Calışkan M, Bochkov YA, Kreiner-Møller E, et al. Rhinovirus wheezing illness and genetic risk of childhood-onset asthma. N Engl J Med 2013;368(15):1398-407

49. Sears MR, Greene JM, Willan AR, et al. Long-term relation between breastfeeding and development of atopy and asthma in children and young adults: a longitudinal study. Lancet 2002;360(9337):901-7

50. Duncan JM, Sears MR. Breastfeeding and allergies: time for a change in paradigm? Curr Opin Allergy Clin Immunol 2008; 8(5):398-405

51. Chen C-M, Tischer C, Schnappinger M, Heinrich J. The role of cats and dogs in asthma and allergy – a systematic review. Int J Hyg Environ Health 2010;213(1):1-31

52. Ege M, Mayer M, Normand A, et al. Exposure to environmental microorganisms and childhood asthma. N Engl J Med 2011;364(8):701-9

53. Olszak T, An D, Zeissig S, et al. Microbial exposure during early life has persistent effects on natural killer T cell function. Science 2012;336(6080):489-93

54. Von Mutius E, Vercelli D. Farm living: effects on childhood asthma and allergy. Nat Rev Immunol 2010;10(12):861-8

55. Brand PLP, Baraldi E, Bisgaard H, et al. Definition, assessment and treatment of wheezing disorders in preschool children: an evidence-based approach. Eur Respir J 2008;32(4):1096-110

56. Savenije OEM, Kerkhof M, Koppelman GH, Postma DS. Predicting who will have asthma at school age among preschool children. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2012;130(2):325-31

57. Savenije OE, Granell R, Caudri D, et al. Comparison of childhood wheezing phenotypes in 2 birth cohorts: ALSPAC and PIAMA. J Allergy Clin Immunol 2011; 127(6):1505-12; e14

58. Martinez FD, Wright AL, Taussig LM, et al. Asthma and wheezing in the first six years of life. The Group Health Medical Associates. N Engl J Med 1995;332(3):133-8

59. Rodriguez-Martinez CE, Sossa-Briceño MP, Castro-Rodriguez JA. Discriminative properties of two predictive indices for asthma diagnosis in a sample of preschoolers with recurrent wheezing. Pediatr Pulmonol 2011;46(12):1175-81